KAWAHITO LAW GROUP APC 222 North Sepulveda Blvd., Suite 2222 El Segundo, CA 90245 Phone: 310-746-5300 Fax: 310-593-2520

IAMES K. KAWAHITO

Direct Dial: 310-746-5302 ikawahito@kawahitolaw.com

June 2, 2017

# 60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.5 ET. SEQ. (PROPOSITION 65)

Dear Alleged Violator(s) and the Appropriate Public Enforcement Agencies:

The Kawahito Law Group APC represents EnviroProtect, LLC ("EnviroProtect") with respect to this matter. EnviroProtect is a California company acting in the interest of the general public seeking to further, among other causes, the protection of the environment, awareness of dangerous chemicals in consumer products, and corporate accountability. As described below, EnviroProtect has identified violations of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65" or "Act"), codified at Cal. Health & Safety Code §25249.5 et seq. This letter serves to provide EnviroProtect's Notice of these violations. Pursuant to §25249.7(d) of the Act, EnviroProtect intends to file a private enforcement action in the public interest sixty (60) days after effective service of this Notice unless the appropriate public enforcement agencies have commenced and are prosecuting an action to rectify these violations.

General Information and Summary of Proposition 65. A copy of a summary of Proposition 65 prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment is attached to this letter.

<u>Alleged Violators</u>. The name of the entity or entities covered by this Notice and who are alleged to be in violation of Proposition 65 (collectively the "Violators") are:

Lifetime Brands, Inc.
TJX Companies, Inc./Marshalls of MA, Inc

<u>Consumer Product</u>. The products ("Products") which are causing an exposure without a warning in violation of Proposition 65, are:

Product(s)	Retailer(s)	Manufacturer(s)/Distributor(s)/ Importer(s)
Blue Bird Mug Marshall's SKU#066270302	Marshall's, 11270 West Olympic Blvd., Los Angeles, CA 90064	Creative Tops, Ltd. a division of Lifetime Brands, Inc.

June 2, 2017 Page 2

<u>Listed Chemical and Route of Exposure</u>. The chemical that is the subject of this Notice is lead. The consumer exposures at issue result from the use of the Products in accordance with their intended use. The primary routes of exposure are ingestion and dermal.

Period of Exposure and Violation. Exposures to lead from the use of the Products have occurred each day since the products were introduced into the California marketplace, but at a minimum since April 30, 2017. Moreover, these exposures will continue every day until clear and reasonable warnings are provided to product purchasers and users or until this known toxic chemical is either removed from or reduced to allowable levels in the Products. Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the listed chemical resulting from contact with the Products, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the listed chemical from reasonable foreseeable use of the Products.

Resolution of Noticed Claims. Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65, EnviroProtect is interested in seeking a constructive resolution to this matter to have the ongoing violations of California law quickly rectified. To that end, EnviroProtect intends to file a private enforcement action as provided for in the Act for the alleged violations by the Violators, unless Violators agree in an enforceable written instrument to: (1) recall the listed Products or undertake best efforts to ensure that the requisite health hazard warnings are provided to those who have received such Products; (2) reformulate the Products so as to eliminate further exposures to the identified chemicals or affix clear and reasonable Proposition 65 warning labels for Products sold in the future; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty. Such a resolution will prevent further unwarned consumer exposures to the identified chemicals, and avoid costly and time-consuming litigation.

To the extent you are interested in discussing a potential early resolution of this matter, you may communicate directly with EnviroProtect's attorneys. Please direct all questions concerning this Notice to James Kawahito at Kawahito Law Group APC, 222 North Sepulveda Blvd., Suite 2222, El Segundo, CA 90245, tel. 310-746-5300, email jkawahito@kawahitolaw.com.

KAWAHITO LAW GROUP APC

Sincerely,

James K. Kawahito

June 2, 2017 Page 3

#### Attachments

Certificate of Merit
Certificate of Service
OEHHA Summary (to Violators only)
Additional Supporting Information for Certificate of Merit (to AG only)

June 2, 2017 Page 4

#### **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

#### Re: EnviroProtect, LLC's Notice of Proposition 65 Violations

- I, James Kawahito, hereby declare:
- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notice violated California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- 2. I am an attorney for the noticing party.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience and have assembled evidence attached to the copy for the California Attorney General as Exhibit 1 to this Certificate of Merit regarding the lack of warnings for the listed chemical that is the subject of the notice.
- 4. Based on the information obtained and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and that the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in California Health & Safety Code §25249.7(h)(2).

Dated: June 2, 2017

James Kawahito

June 2, 2017 Page 5

#### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I am over the age of 18 and not a party to this case. I am a resident of or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. My business address is 222 North Sepulveda Blvd., Suite 2222, El Segundo, CA 90245.

On June 2, 2017, I served the following: 1. 60-Day Notice of Intent to Sue Under Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 2. Certificate of Merit; Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d) 3. The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65); A Summary on the alleged Violators listed below via First Class Certified Mail through the United States Postal Service by placing a true and correct copy in a sealed envelope, addressed to the parties listed below and providing such envelope to a United States Postal Service Representative:

Marshalls of MA, Inc c/o CT Corporation System 818 W. 7<sup>th</sup> Street, Suite 930 Los Angeles, CA 90017 Current President/CEO Marshalls of MA, Inc. The TJX Companies, Inc. 770 Cochituate Road Framingham, MA 01701

Creative Tops, Ltd., a division of Lifetime Brands, Inc. c/o Corporation Service Company 2710 Gateway Oaks Dr., Suite 150 N Sacramento, CA 95833 Current President/CEO
Creative Tops, Ltd., a division of
Lifetime Brands, Inc.
1000 Stewart Avenue
Garden City, NY 11530

On June 2, 2017 I served the following: 1. 60-Day Notice of Intent to Sue Under Health and Safety Code section 25249.6; 2. Certificate of Merit; Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d); 3. Certificate of Merit (Attorney General Copy); Factual information sufficient to establish the basis of the certificate of merit On the following parties by uploading the foregoing documents at the webpage listed

Office of the California Attorney General Prop 65 Enforcement

below:

https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice

On June 2, 2017 I served the following: 1. 60-Day Notice of Intent to Sue Under Health and Safety Code section 25249.6; 2. Certificate of Merit; Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d) to the public enforcers by placing a true and correct copy in a sealed

June 2, 2017 Page 6

envelope, with postage fully prepaid with the U.S. Postal Service, addressed to the parties listed on the attached **Service List**.

I declare under penalty of perjury that under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct.

**Dated: June 2, 2017** 

Sebastian Burnside

June 2, 2017 Page 7

#### **SERVICE LIST**

Armador County District Attorney 108 Court Street, #202 108 Court Street, #202 108 County District Attorney 108 County District Attorney 108 Colusa County District Attorney 109 Colusa, CA 95642 109 Colusa, CA 95932 109 Colusa, CA 95932 109 Columbia Street 109 Columb
ackson, CA 95642 Colusa County District Attorney 46 5th Street, Suite 101 Colusa, CA 95932 Cl Dorado County District Attorney 15 Main Street Placerville, CA 95667  Humboldt County District Attorney 125 5th Street, 4th Floor Cureka, CA 95501  Kern County District Attorney 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301 Lassen County District Attorney 120 S. Lassen Street Susanville, CA 96130 Ifield_prop65ctacts_title] Inlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us Marin County District Attorney 13501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903  Merced County District Attorney 1550 West Main Street
Colusa County District Attorney 46 5th Street, Suite 101 Colusa, CA 95932 El Dorado County District Attorney 115 Main Street Placerville, CA 95667  Humboldt County District Attorney 125 5th Street, 4th Floor Eureka, CA 95501  Kern County District Attorney 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301 Lassen County District Attorney 120 S. Lassen Street Susanville, CA 96130 Ifield_prop65ctacts_title] Inlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us Marin County District Attorney 13501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903  Merced County District Attorney 1550 West Main Street
246 5th Street, Suite 101 Colusa, CA 95932 El Dorado County District Attorney El Salar Street Placerville, CA 95667  Humboldt County District Attorney El Street, 4th Floor Eureka, CA 95501 Kern County District Attorney El Sakersfield, CA 93301 Lassen County District Attorney El Susanville, CA 96130 Field_prop65ctacts_title] Inlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us Marin County District Attorney El Salar Street El Salar Street El Salar Street El Susanville, CA 96130 Field_prop65ctacts_title] Final County District Attorney El Salar County District Attorney El S
Colusa, CA 95932 El Dorado County District Attorney El Salam Street Placerville, CA 95667  Humboldt County District Attorney El Street, 4 <sup>th</sup> Floor Eureka, CA 95501  Kern County District Attorney El Sakersfield, CA 93301  Lassen County District Attorney El Susanville, CA 96130  field_prop65ctacts_title] Inlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us Marin County District Attorney El Salam Rafael, CA 94903  Merced County District Attorney El Salam Rafael, CA 94903  Merced County District Attorney El Salam Street
El Dorado County District Attorney El Sala Main Street Placerville, CA 95667  Humboldt County District Attorney El Street, 4 <sup>th</sup> Floor Eureka, CA 95501  Kern County District Attorney El Sakersfield, CA 93301 Lassen County District Attorney El Susanville, CA 96130 El El Susanville, CA 96130
Humboldt County District Attorney E25 5th Street, 4th Floor Eureka, CA 95501  Kern County District Attorney E3th Street, 4th Floor Eureka, CA 95501  Kern County District Attorney E3th Street, 4th Floor Eureka, CA 95301  Lassen County District Attorney E3th Street E3th S
Humboldt County District Attorney 125 5th Street, 4th Floor Eureka, CA 95501 Kern County District Attorney 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301 Lassen County District Attorney 120 S. Lassen Street Susanville, CA 96130 Ifield_prop65ctacts_title] Inlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us Marin County District Attorney 1501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903  Merced County District Attorney 1500 West Main Street
Humboldt County District Attorney 525 5th Street, 4th Floor Eureka, CA 95501  Kern County District Attorney 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301 Lassen County District Attorney 1220 S. Lassen Street Eusanville, CA 96130 Ifield_prop65ctacts_title] Inlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us Marin County District Attorney 13501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903  Merced County District Attorney 1550 West Main Street
Eureka, CA 95501  Kern County District Attorney 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301 Lassen County District Attorney 220 S. Lassen Street Susanville, CA 96130 field_prop65ctacts_title] mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us Marin County District Attorney 3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903  Merced County District Attorney 550 West Main Street
Eureka, CA 95501  Kern County District Attorney 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301 Lassen County District Attorney 220 S. Lassen Street Susanville, CA 96130 field_prop65ctacts_title] mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us Marin County District Attorney 3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903  Merced County District Attorney 550 West Main Street
Eureka, CA 95501  Kern County District Attorney 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301 Lassen County District Attorney 220 S. Lassen Street Susanville, CA 96130 field_prop65ctacts_title] mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us Marin County District Attorney 3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903  Merced County District Attorney 550 West Main Street
Eureka, CA 95501  Kern County District Attorney 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301 Lassen County District Attorney 1220 S. Lassen Street Susanville, CA 96130 Ifield_prop65ctacts_title] Inlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us Marin County District Attorney 1501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903  Merced County District Attorney 1500 West Main Street
Kern County District Attorney 215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301 Lassen County District Attorney 220 S. Lassen Street Susanville, CA 96130 field_prop65ctacts_title] mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us Marin County District Attorney 3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903  Merced County District Attorney 550 West Main Street
215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301 Lassen County District Attorney 220 S. Lassen Street Susanville, CA 96130 field_prop65ctacts_title] mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us Marin County District Attorney 8501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903  Merced County District Attorney 550 West Main Street
Bakersfield, CA 93301  Lassen County District Attorney 220 S. Lassen Street Susanville, CA 96130  field_prop65ctacts_title] mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us  Marin County District Attorney 8501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903  Merced County District Attorney 550 West Main Street
Lassen County District Attorney 220 S. Lassen Street Susanville, CA 96130 field_prop65ctacts_title] mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us Marin County District Attorney 8501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903  Merced County District Attorney 550 West Main Street
220 S. Lassen Street Susanville, CA 96130 field_prop65ctacts_title] mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us Marin County District Attorney 3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903  Merced County District Attorney 550 West Main Street
Susanville, CA 96130 field_prop65ctacts_title] mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us Marin County District Attorney 8501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903  Merced County District Attorney 550 West Main Street
field_prop65ctacts_title] inlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us  Marin County District Attorney  3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130  San Rafael, CA 94903  Merced County District Attorney  550 West Main Street
field_prop65ctacts_title] inlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us  Marin County District Attorney  3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130  San Rafael, CA 94903  Merced County District Attorney  550 West Main Street
Marin County District Attorney 3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903  Merced County District Attorney 550 West Main Street
Marin County District Attorney 3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903  Merced County District Attorney 550 West Main Street
San Rafael, CA 94903  Merced County District Attorney 550 West Main Street
San Rafael, CA 94903  Merced County District Attorney 550 West Main Street
Merced County District Attorney 550 West Main Street
550 West Main Street
550 West Main Street
Merced, CA 95340
Monterey County District Attorney
1200 Aguajito Road
Monterey, CA 93940
Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us
Orange County District Attorney
401 Civic Center Drive West
Santa Ana, CA 92701
<del></del>
Riverside County District Attorney
3072 Orange Street
Riverside, CA 92501
Prop65@rivcoda.org
San Bernardino County District
Attorney
303 W. Third Street
San Bernardino, CA 92415
San Joaquin County District Attorney
222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202
Stockton, CA 95202
DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.or
12 M P O 44 S

June 2, 2017 Page 8

San Luis Obispo County District Attorney County Government Center Annex, 4th Floor San Luis Obispo, CA 93408 [field_prop65ctacts_title] edobroth@co.slo.ca.us	San Mateo County District Attorney 400 County Center, Third Floor Redwood City, CA 94063	Santa Barbara County District Attorney 1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101
Santa Clara County District Attorney 70 W Hedding St San Jose, CA 95110 EPU@da.sccgov.org	Santa Cruz County District Attorney 701 Ocean Street, Room 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060	Shasta County District Attorney 1355 West Street Redding, CA 96001
Sierra County District Attorney 100 Courthouse Square	Siskiyou County District Attorney P.O. Box 986	Solano County District Attorney 675 Texas Street, Suite 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533
Sonoma County District Attorney 600 Administration Dr Sonoma, CA 95403	Yreka, CA 96097  Stanislaus County District Attorney 832 12th Street, Suite 300  Modesto, CA 95353	Sutter County District Attorney 446 Second Street, Suite 102 Yuba City, CA 95991
jbarnes@sonoma-county.org Tehama County District Attorney P.O. Box 519 Red Bluff, CA 96080	Trinity County District Attorney P.O. Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093	Tulare County District Attorney 221 S Mooney Blvd Visalia, CA 95370 Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us
Tuolumne County District Attorney 423 N. Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370	Ventura County District Attorney 800 S Victoria Ave Ventura, CA 93009 daspecialops@ventura.org	Yolo County District Attorney 301 Second Street Woodland, CA 95695 cfepd@yolocounty.org
Yuba County District Attorney 215 Fifth Street, Suite 152 Marysville, CA 95901	Los Angeles City Attorney's Office City Hall East 200 N. Main Street, Suite 800 Los Angeles, CA 90012	San Francisco, City Attorney City Hall, Room 234 1 Dr Carlton B Goodlett Pl, San Francisco, CA 94102
San Diego City Attorney's Office 1200 Third Ave #1620, San Diego, CA 92101	Oakland City Attorney City Hall, 6 <sup>th</sup> Floor 1 Frank Ogawa Plaza Oakland, CA 94612	